

Wampold, B.E. How important are the common factors in psychotherapy? An update // *World Psychiatry*. 2015. Vol. 14. No. 3. P. 270–277.

Wampold, B.E., Minami, T., Baskin, T.W. et al. A meta-(re) analysis of the effects of cognitive therapy versus ‘other therapies’ for depression // *Journal of affective disorders*. 2002. Vol. 68. No. 2–3. P. 159–165.

Wampold, B.E., Mondin, G.W., Moody, M. et al. The flat earth as a metaphor for the evidence for uniform efficacy of bona fide psychotherapies: Reply to Crits-Christoph (1997) and Howard et al. (1997) // *Psychological Bulletin*. 1997a. Vol. 122. No. 3. P. 226–230.

Wampold, B.E., Mondin, G.W., Moody, M. et al. A meta-analysis of outcome studies comparing bona fide psychotherapies: Empirically, “all must have prizes.” // *Psychological bulletin*. 1997b. Vol. 122. No. 3. P. 203–215.

Информация об авторе

Кирилл С. Крючков, член совета Всемирной ассоциации человеко-центрированной и экспериментальной психотерапии и консультирования (ВАРСЕПС), преподаватель, кафедра психотерапии и психологического консультирования, факультет психологии, Московский институт психоанализа, Москва, Россия; 121170, Россия, Москва, Кутузовский проспект, д. 34, стр. 14; *kkryuchkov@gmail.com*

Kryuchkov K.S.

Ongoing disputes on therapy efficacy:
‘golden standards’ and ‘common factors’

Moscow institute of psychoanalysis, Moscow, Russia

In the present paper author reviews current research and theoretical studies dedicated to psychotherapy efficacy. Author polemizes with the position that ‘Evidence-Based Approaches’ are the most efficient in psychotherapy and that psychotherapy approaches must be tested against natural-sciences and medical criteria of efficacy. Author discusses the history of the psychotherapy researches, from the point of the discussions about the general efficacy of psychotherapy versus placebo, to the point of the discussions about ‘the most effective approach in psychotherapy’. Author reviews studies dedicated to the ‘Dodo-bird effect’ (equivalency paradox), as well as studies that refute the conjectures that some forms of treatment (namely, CBT or EBT) are more efficient than the others. Author shows that in accordance to the research results, it is not correct to call one specific therapy approach as the most efficient in comparison to the others. Author also reviews ‘common factors studies’ that emphasize an importance of psychotherapist own professional and personal qualities rather than techniques or therapeutic modality therapist prefers. Author warns that

psychotherapy should not be reduced to the set of ‘skills’ or techniques, the person – psychotherapist – is a key figure of psychotherapy, and this figure should not be ‘put out of the brackets’ of the psychotherapy realm.

Key words: psychotherapy research, psychotherapy efficacy, psychotherapy skills, common factors theory, equivalency paradox, dodo-bird effect

For citation: Kryuchkov, K.S. (2021). Ongoing disputes on therapy efficacy: ‘golden standards’ and ‘common factors’ in psychotherapy. *New Psychological Research*, No. 2, pp. 100–114, DOI: 10.51217/npsyresearch_2021_01_02_06

Acknowledgement

The study was supported by the Russian Foundation for Basic Research, project 20-313-90031.

References

Anderson, T., Lunnen, K.M., Ogles, B.M. (2010). Putting models and techniques in context. In: B.L. Duncan (Ed.), *The heart and soul of change: Delivering what works in therapy* (pp. 143–166). Washington DC: APA.

Baardseth, T.P., Goldberg, S.B., Pace, B.T., Wislocki, A.P., Frost, N.D., Siddiqui, J.R., (...) Wampold, B.E. (2013). Cognitive-behavioral therapy versus other therapies: Redux. *Clinical psychology review*, 33(3), 395–405.

Campbell, L.F., Norcross, J.C., Vasquez, M.J., Kaslow, N.J. (2013). Recognition of psychotherapy effectiveness: The APA resolution. *Psychotherapy*, 50(1), 98–101.

Cuijpers, P., Berking, M., Andersson, G., Quigley L., Kleiboer A., Dobson K.S. (2013). A meta-analysis of cognitive-behavioural therapy for adult depression, alone and in comparison with other treatments. *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 58(7), 376–385.

Drisko, J.W., Grady, M.D. (2019). *Evidence-based practice in clinical social work*. Cham, Switzerland: Springer.

Hill, C.E. (2009). *Helping skills: Facilitating, exploration, insight, and action*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

Imel, Z.E., Wampold, B.E. (2008). The importance of treatment and the science of common factors in psychotherapy. In S.D. Brown, R.W. Lent (Eds.), *Handbook of counseling psychology* (Vol. 4, pp. 249–266). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.

Kholmogorova, A.B. (2009). Two confictory methodologies for psychotherapy and its efficiency research: seeking a way out. *Konsul'tativnaya psikhologiya i psikhoterapiya*, 17(4), 5–26.

Kholmogorova, A.B. (2010). Two conflicting methodologies in the studies of psychotherapy and its efficacy: in search for a third way. Part 2. *Konsul'tativnaya psikhologiya i psikhoterapiya*, 18(1), 14–37.

Kholmogorova, A.B., Garanyan, N.G., Nikitina, I.V., Pugovkina, O.D. (2009). Research concerning the process of psychotherapy and its efficacy: current situation. Part 1. *Sotsial'naya i klinicheskaya psikhatriya*, 19(3), 92–100.

Kholmogorova, A.B., Garanyan, N.G., Nikitina, I.V., Pugovkina, O.D. (2010). Research concerning the process of psychotherapy and its efficacy: current situation. Part 2. *Sotsial'naya i klinicheskaya psikhatriya*, 20(1), 70–79.

Kolotilshikova, E.A., Mizinova, E.B., Poltorak, S.V., Chekhlatyi, E.I. (2011). Motivation in psychotherapy (Literature review). *Obozrenie psikhologii i meditsinskoj psikhologii imeni VM Bekhtereva*, 2, 13–16.

Lambert, M.J., Norcross, J.C. (1992). *Handbook of psychotherapy integration*. New York: Basic Books.

Laska, K.M., Gurman, A.S., Wampold, B.E. (2014). Expanding the lens of evidence-based practice in psychotherapy: A common factors perspective. *Psychotherapy*, 51(4), 467–481.

Luborsky, L., Rosenthal, R., Diguier, L., Andrusyna, T.P., Berman, J.S. (...) Krause, E.D. (2002). The dodo bird verdict is alive and well—mostly. *Clinical Psychology: Science and Practice*, 9(1), 2–12.

Luborsky, L., Singer, B., Luborsky, L. (1975). Comparative studies of psychotherapies: Is it true that everyone has won and all must have prizes? *Archives of general psychiatry*, 32(8), 995–1008.

Mendelevich, V.D. (2019). Evidence-based psychotherapy: between the possible and the necessary. *Neurologicheskii vestnik*, 51(2), 5–12.

Nahum, D., Alfonso, C.A., Sönmez, E. (2019). Common factors in psychotherapy. In A. Javed, K.N. Fountoulakis (Eds.), *Advances in psychiatry* (pp. 471–481). Cham, Switzerland: Springer.

Norcross, J.C., Lambert, M.J. (2011). Psychotherapy relationships that work II. *Psychotherapy*, 48(1), 4–8. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0022180>

Orlov, A.B. (2006). The Nascent Psychotherapy. *Psikhologiya. Zhurnal Vyshei shkoly ekonomiki*, 3(1), 82–96.

Rogers, C. (2012). The necessary and sufficient conditions of therapeutic personality changes. *Zhurnal prakticheskogo psikhologa*, 1, 8–25.

Thomas, M.L. (2006). The contributing factors of change in a therapeutic process. *Contemporary Family Therapy*, 28(2), 201–210.

Tolin, D.F. (2010). Is cognitive-behavioral therapy more effective than other therapies?: A meta-analytic review. *Clinical psychology review*, 30(6), 710–720.

Tracey, T.J., Lichtenberg, J.W., Goodyear, R.K., Claiborn, C.D., Wampold, B.E. (2003). Concept mapping of therapeutic common factors. *Psychotherapy Research*, 13(4), 401–413.

Truijens, F., Zühlke-van Hulzen, L., Vanheule, S. (2019). To manualize, or not to manualize: Is that still the question? A systematic review of empirical

evidence for manual superiority in psychological treatment. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 75(3), 329–343.

Vasilenko, D., Kucherenko, V., Petrenko, V. (2020). The Tower of Babel of Psychotherapy. Psychology. *Psikbologiya. Zhurnal Vysheï shkoly ekonomiki*, 17(1), 10–26.

Wampold, B.E. (2015). How important are the common factors in psychotherapy? An update. *World Psychiatry*, 14(3), 270–277.

Wampold, B.E., Minami, T., Baskin, T.W., Tierney, S.C. (2002). A meta-(re) analysis of the effects of cognitive therapy versus ‘other therapies’ for depression. *Journal of affective disorders*, 68(2–3), 159–165.

Wampold, B.E., Mondin, G.W., Moody, M., Ahn, H.N. (1997a). The flat earth as a metaphor for the evidence for uniform efficacy of bona fide psychotherapies: Reply to Crits-Christoph (1997) and Howard et al. (1997). *Psychological Bulletin*, 122(3), 226–230. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.122.3.226>

Wampold, B.E., Mondin, G.W., Moody, M., Stich, F., Benson, K., Ahn, H.N. (1997b). A meta-analysis of outcome studies comparing bona fide psychotherapies: Empirically, “all must have prizes.” *Psychological bulletin*, 122(3), 203–215.

Information about an author

Kirill S. Kryuchkov, M.S., LLB, Board Member of the World Association for Person Centered & Experiential Psychotherapy & Counseling (WAPCEPC), Senior Lecturer, Department of psychotherapy and psychological counseling, Moscow Institute of Psychoanalysis; bld. 34–14, Kutuzovsky av., Moscow, Russia, 121170; kkryuchkov@gmail.com